

## Isles of Scilly: Men a Vaur to White Island (FS rMCZ35i) Evidence Review

Region	Finding Sanctuary	
Site Name/number	Isles of Scilly: Men a Vaur to White Island (FS rMCZ35i)	
ENG Features present and proposed for inclusion within MCZ designation	BSH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• High energy intertidal rock</li> <li>• Moderate energy intertidal rock</li> <li>• Intertidal coarse sediment</li> <li>• Intertidal sand and muddy sand</li> <li>• Intertidal mud</li> <li>• High energy infralittoral rock</li> <li>• Moderate energy infralittoral rock</li> <li>• High energy circalittoral rock</li> <li>• Moderate energy circalittoral rock</li> <li>• Subtidal sand</li> </ul>
	Habitat FOCI	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fragile sponge &amp; anthozoan communities on subtidal rocky habitats</li> <li>• Intertidal under boulder communities</li> <li>• Seagrass beds</li> <li>• Tide-swept channels</li> </ul>
	Species FOCI	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Amphianthus dohrnii</i></li> <li>• <i>Eunicella verrucosa</i></li> <li>• <i>Haliclystus auricula</i></li> <li>• <i>Lucernariopsis campanulata</i></li> <li>• <i>Palinurus elephas</i></li> </ul>
ENG Features present but not proposed for inclusion within MCZ designation	BSH	-
	Habitat FOCI	-
	Species FOCI	-
Non-ENG Features (Geological/geomorphological)		-

### Evidence Summary – data supplied by Regional MCZ Projects

Feature	Evidence Summary	Key Sources
High energy intertidal rock	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 20 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001070 and MB0102 GB001070 polygons. Point data were available from 7 MESH points. Aerial imagery from CCO	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MB0102 MESH CCO
Moderate energy intertidal rock	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by point data derived from 5 MESH points. No polygon	MESH CCO

	data were available. Aerial imagery from CCO	
Intertidal coarse sediment	The extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 7 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap and GB001070 MB0102 GB001070 polygons. Aerial imagery from CCO	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MB0102 CCO
Intertidal sand and muddy sand	The extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 26 MB0102 GB001070 polygons. No point data were available. Aerial imagery from CCO	MB0102 CCO
Intertidal mud	No GI. Aerial imagery from CCO	CCO
High energy infralittoral rock	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data from 4 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055 polygons. Point data were available from 23 MESH points.	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MESH
Moderate energy infralittoral rock	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 5 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055 polygons. Point data were available from 3 MESH points.	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MESH
High energy circalittoral rock	Point data were available from 12 MESH points.	MESH
Moderate energy circalittoral rock	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 2 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055 polygons. Point data were available from 3 MESH points.	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MESH
Subtidal sand	The presence and extent of this broad-scale habitat was supported by polygon data derived from 6 Combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB00498 polygons. Point data were available from 1 MESH point.	Combined MESH/UKSeaMap MESH
Fragile sponge & anthozoan communities on subtidal rocky	The presence and extent of this habitat FOCI was supported by polygon data derived from 6 loS_LG_habitat_poly_NewInters	MESH Regional Projects - FS

habitats	ect polygons. Point data were available from 2 MESH points, 1 Marine Recorder point, 1 Habitat_HOCI_Points_NewIntersect point and 1 Isles of Scilly Wildlife Trust, SeaSearch point from Regional Project -FS.	
Intertidal under boulder communities	Point data were available from 2 Habitat_HOCI_Points_NewIntersect points from Regional Project - FS and 1 MESH point.	MESH Regional Project - FS
Seagrass beds	The presence and extent of this habitat FOCI was supported by polygon data derived from 305 loS_Zostera_Marina_2008_simp_M CZ polygons and 2 loS_LG_habitat_poly_NewIntersect polygons from Regional Project - FS. No point data were available.	Regional Project - FS
Tide-swept channels	The presence and extent of this habitat FOCI was supported by polygon data derived from 2 loS_LG_habitat_poly_NewIntersect polygons. Point data were available from 1 Habitat_HOCI_Points_NewIntersect point from Regional Project - FS.	Regional Project - FS
<i>Amphianthus dohrnii</i>	No GI	No GI
<i>Eunicella verrucosa</i>	The presence and extent of this species FOCI was supported by point data derived from 4 Non_mobile_Species_NewIntersect points, 2 FS_Sample_Species_1982_NewIntersect points, and 9 Cornwall_FOCI_Species_NewIntersect points from Regional Projects - FS. No polygon data were available.	Regional Project - FS
<i>Haliclystus auricula</i>	The presence and extent of this species FOCI was supported by point data from 2 Cornwall_FOCI_Species_NewIntersect points Regional Project - FS. No polygon data were available.	Regional Project - FS
<i>Lucernariopsis campanulata</i>	The presence and extent of this species FOCI was supported by point data derived from 1 Cornwall_FOCI_Species_NewIntersect point from Regional Project	Regional Project - FS MB0102

	- FS and 1 Non_mobile_Species_NewIntersect point from MB0102. No polygon data were available.	
<i>Palinurus elephas</i>	The presence and extent of this species FOCI was supported by point data derived from 2 Cornwall_FOCI_Species_NewIntersect points from Regional Project - FS and 1 Non_mobile_Species_NewIntersect point from MB0102.	Regional Project – FS MB0102

### Description of New Evidence Identified by MB0116 project

Anecdotal evidence provide by NE to MB0116 project

Evidence Description	Source	Feature
Irving, R.A. and Northern, K.O. (2012) Isles of Scilly SAC Diving Monitoring Studies, 2011.	Natural England Commissioned Reports, Number 104	High energy infralittoral rock
Isles of Scilly Intertidal Biotope Mapping Dataset (2010)	ERCCIS	High energy intertidal rock Intertidal under boulder communities
Marine BAP Habitats and Species of the Isles of Scilly - an update to the Isles of Scilly Environmental Audit 2008.	Gall, A. (2011)	Intertidal sand and muddy sand Moderate energy intertidal rock Intertidal under boulder communities
Jackson, E.L., Higgs, S., Allsop, T., Cawthray, A., Evans, J. and Langmead, O. (2011) Isles of Scilly Seagrass Mapping.	Natural England Commissioned Reports, Number 087	Intertidal under boulder communities
Cook, K.J. (2011) Report on 2011 Isles of Scilly <i>Zostera marina</i> survey.	Report to Natural England	Seagrass beds
Polygon data	SW Habitat Mapping	Intertidal coarse sediment Intertidal under boulder communities
Polygon data	Cornwall Wildlife Trust	High energy circalittoral rock Moderate energy circalittoral rock
Data points	SeaSearch	Fragile sponge & anthozoan communities on subtidal rocky habitats
Data points	ERCCIS & Cornwall Wildlife Trust	<i>Eunicella verrucosa</i> <i>Haliclystus auricula</i>

Data points	Marine Recorder - MBA	<i>Haliclystus auricular</i> <i>Palinurus elephas</i>
-------------	-----------------------	--

#### Evidence That Could Not Be Acquired by MB0116 project

Evidence Description	Source	Feature
Isles of Scilly Intertidal Biotope Mapping Dataset (2010)	ERCCIS	High energy intertidal rock Intertidal under boulder communities

#### Confidence Assessment undertaken by MB0116 project

Feature	Presence	Extent	Condition	Boundaries (site)
High energy intertidal rock	High	High	Low	Low
Moderate energy intertidal rock	Moderate	Moderate	Low	
Intertidal coarse sediment	High	Moderate	Low	
Intertidal sand and muddy sand	High	High	Low	
Intertidal mud	Low	Low	Low	
High energy infralittoral rock	Low	Low	Low	
Moderate energy infralittoral rock	Low	Low	Low	
High energy circalittoral rock	Moderate	Low	Low	
Moderate energy circalittoral rock	Low	Low	Low	
Subtidal sand	Low	Low	Low	
Fragile sponge & anthozoan communities on subtidal rocky habitats	Low	Low	Low	
Intertidal under boulder communities	Moderate	Low	Low	
Seagrass beds	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	
Tide-swept channels	Low	Low	Low	
<i>Amphianthus dohrnii</i>	No confidence	No confidence	No confidence	
<i>Eunicella verrucosa</i>	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	

<i>Haliclystus auricula</i>	Low	Low	Low	
<i>Lucernariopsis campanulata</i>	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	
<i>Palinurus elephas</i>	Low	Low	Low	

The presence and extent of the broad-scale habitat 'High energy intertidal rock' was supported by combined MESH/UKSeaMap and MB0102 GB001070 polygons. Seven MESH points were also available in support of the feature presence which fell outside of the feature polygon however the aerial photography confirmed the feature presence and overlapped the feature polygons by more than 90% thus the confidence in both presence and extent of this feature was considered to be 'high'.

No polygon data were available to support the occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'Moderate energy intertidal rock'. However, 5 MESH points were present to verify its presence and this was confirmed by the aerial photography, giving a confidence score of 'moderate', however without a habitat map the extent was also assessed as 'moderate'.

The occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'Intertidal coarse sediment' was supported by combined MESH/UKSeaMap, MB0102 and 'SW\_Habitat\_Mapping' polygons. No point data were available, and no non-conflicting modelled data could support the presence of this feature, however the aerial photography confirms the presence of the feature within the majority of the feature polygons and covering between 50 and 90% of these therefore confidence in the presence and extent of this feature was considered to be 'high and 'moderate' respectively'.

The occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'Intertidal sand and muddy sand' was supported by combined MESH/UKSeaMap and MB0102 polygons. No point data were available, and no non-conflicting modelled data could support the presence of this feature, however the aerial photography confirms the presence of the feature within the feature polygons and overlaps more than 90%. Therefore confidence in the presence and extent of this feature was considered to be 'high'.

The occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'Intertidal mud' was supported by 'SW\_Habitat\_Mapping' polygons. No point data were available, and no non-conflicting modelled data could support the presence of this feature, and the aerial photography does not confirm the feature presence therefore confidence in both the presence and extent of this feature was categorised as 'low'.

The occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'High energy infralittoral rock' was supported by polygon data derived from combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055. 9 points were present within the feature polygons, though only 2 (22%) were in agreement with both the feature and parent type (EUNIS level 2). As such, confidence in the presence of this feature was categorised as 'low'. Multiple validation points were spread over less than 50% of the feature polygons, therefore confidence in the extent of the broad-scale habitat was categorised as 'moderate'. However, the confidence score assigned to extent was reduced to 'low' to reflect the low confidence score assigned to the presence of this feature.

The occurrence of 'Moderate energy infralittoral rock' was supported by combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055 and 'Cornwall Wildlife Trust' polygons respectively. 3 and 12 MESH points respectively were also available in support of the feature presence, though they fell outside of the feature polygon resulting in confidence being categorised as 'low'. No

validation points were available to assess the feature's extent and, as such, confidence in the feature's extent was categorised as 'low'.

'High energy circalittoral rock' was supported by combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055 and 'Cornwall Wildlife Trust' polygons respectively. 3 and 12 MESH points respectively were also available in support of the feature presence, though they fell outside of the feature polygon, however the anecdotal evidence confirmed the presence of the feature at one location resulting in confidence being categorised as 'moderate'. No validation points were available to assess the feature's extent and, as such, confidence was categorised as 'low'.

The occurrence of the broad-scale habitat 'Moderate energy circalittoral rock' was supported by polygon data derived from combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB001055. 13 points were present within the feature polygons, though only 1 (8%) was in agreement with the feature type and 8 (62%) in agreement with the parent type (EUNIS level 2). As such, confidence in the presence of this feature was categorised as 'low'. However, as only a single point was within the feature polygons, confidence in the extent of the feature could only be categorised as 'low'.

The presence and extent of the broad-scale habitat 'Subtidal sand' was supported by polygon data with a MESH confidence score of 72, derived from combined MESH/UKSeaMap GB000498. This was corroborated by 1 MESH point, within the feature polygons. This meant confidence in the presence of the feature was categorised as 'low'. However, as only a single point was within the feature polygons, confidence in the extent of the feature could only be categorised as 'low'.

Polygon data derived from 'IoS\_LG\_habitat\_poly\_NewIntersect' supported the presence of the habitat FOCI 'Fragile sponge & anthozoan communities on subtidal rocky habitats'. A total of 10 point records fell within the habitat FOCI, with 2 (20%) in agreement, hence confidence in the presence of this habitat FOCI being categorised as 'low'. These same 2 points were distributed over less than 50% of the habitat FOCI polygons, so confidence in its extent could be categorised as 'moderate'. However, the confidence score assigned to extent was reduced to 'low' to reflect the low confidence score assigned to the presence of this feature.

Polygon data derived from 'SW\_Habitat\_Mapping' and 'SW\_Habitat\_Mapping\_BAP' supported the presence of the habitat FOCI 'Intertidal under boulder communities'. With 1 MESH point falling within the habitat FOCI, however anecdotal evidence from Gall (2011) confirms the presence of the feature but without a supporting habitat map confidence in the presence is considered to be 'moderate' and extent of this habitat was categorised as 'low'.

The habitat FOCI 'Seagrass beds' was supported by data derived from 'IoS\_Zostera\_Marina\_2008\_simp\_MCZ' and 'IoS\_LG\_habitat\_poly\_NewIntersect'. Confidence in presence of the feature was given enhanced by 305 polygons being less than 6 years old and the anecdotal evidence from Jackson *et al*, (2011) giving a score of 'moderate'. The resolution of the habitat map provided within the anecdotal evidence was not high enough to provide confidence above 'moderate' for extent.

Two polygons from 'IoS\_LG\_habitat\_poly\_NewIntersect' and 'Habitat\_HOCI\_Points\_NewIntersect' supported the presence of the 'Tide-swept channels'. An absence of point data overlapping the feature polygons resulted in confidence in both the presence and extent of this habitat being categorised as 'low'.

The presence and extent of the SOCI '*Eunicella verrucosa*', was supported by 18 points derived from 'Non\_mobile\_Species\_NewIntersect', 'Cornwall\_FOCI\_Species\_NewIntersect', 'MarineRecorderSpecies\_NewIntersect', 'FS\_Sample\_Species\_1982\_NewIntersect' and 'FOCI\_April\_09\_MCZ' survey points, of which 9 records were collected by specialists with 3 being less than 6 years old. Therefore, confidence in the SOCI presence was scored as 'moderate' whilst extent was categorised as 'high'. However, the confidence score assigned to extent was reduced to 'moderate' to reflect the moderate confidence score assigned to the presence of this feature.

The presence and extent of the SOCI '*Haliclystus auricula*', was supported by 2 points derived from 'Cornwall\_FOCI\_Species\_NewIntersect' and 'Non\_mobile\_Species\_NewIntersect', both of which were more than 12 years old. Therefore, confidence in both the presence and extent of the SOCI was categorised as 'low'.

The presence and extent of the SOCI '*Lucernariopsis campanulata*', was supported by 8 points derived from 'Cornwall\_FOCI\_Species\_NewIntersect' and 'FOCI\_April\_09\_MCZ' survey points, of which no records were collected by specialists, but 6 were less than 6 years old. Therefore, confidence in the SOCI presence was scored as 'moderate' whilst extent was given as 'high'. However, the confidence score assigned to extent was reduced to 'moderate' to reflect the moderate confidence score assigned to the presence of this feature.

The presence and extent of the SOCI '*Palinurus elephas*', was supported by 4 points derived from Marine Conservation Society, 'Cornwall\_FOCI\_Species\_NewIntersect' and 'Non\_mobile\_Species\_NewIntersect', all of which were more than 12 years old. Therefore, confidence in both the presence and extent of the SOCI were both considered as 'low'.

There was no geographic information available for the ENG feature '*Amphianthus dohrnii*', and therefore a confidence score could not be assigned.

The BSH, HOCl, *Haliclystus auricula* and *Palinurus elephas* are not considered highly sensitive to any pressures considered within the MB0102 sensitivity X pressures matrix and hence confidence in condition, based on this, they have been assessed as low. *Eunicella verrucosa* and *Lucernariopsis campanulata* were considered to be sensitive (by project MB0102) to a number of pressures caused by human activities. These species are sensitive to fishing activities that disturb the seabed and these were indicated by evidence gathered through Charting Progress 2 to occur across the site. Confidence in condition is therefore assessed as 'moderate'.

The confidence assessment in the boundary of the site was classified as low primarily because the overall confidence in the extent of the respective BSH and Habitat FOCI was determined as 'low'.